

October 12, 2016

Chairman Thomas DeRoss called the meeting of the Tipp City Tree Board to order on Wednesday, October 12, 2016 at 5:15 p.m. Other Board Members in attendance included Joanna Pittenger and Adam Blake. Also in attendance were Streets and Parks Superintendent Jim Asher, Tipp City Arborist Anthony Freels, Board Secretary Dawn Gross and Board Secretary Jennica Whitt.

Citizens present: Steve Combs of L.S. Combs Inc., Xenia, OH and Vic Roberts of RB Jergens.

Minutes

Chairman DeRoss asked for discussion. Being no further discussion, Ms. Pittenger **moved to approve the August 10, 2016 meeting minutes as written with the notation that the next meeting as scheduled should read December 12, 2016 instead of October 12, 2016, as listed on the agenda.** Seconded by Mr. DeRoss and unanimously approved. **Motion carried. Since this meeting, it has been noted that the correct date for the next meeting is December 14, 2016.**

Items Not on the Agenda

- Mr. DeRoss stated that there will be further discussion at tonight's meeting regarding attending the Operating Budget meeting being held on October 24, 2016. See details below.
- 335 N. Second St. - Request for removal of 2 dead Ash trees noted by Mrs. Pittenger. See details below.
- Tree in front of the American Legion building. See details below.

New Business

Tree Planting/Removal Requests

The Board discussed and concurred on the following request:

- 528 Horton Ave. – Planting by City
 - The original application, by the resident Margaret Stockler, for a planting request states that the original tree was removed 2 years ago. Mr. DeRoss confirmed this information with Jim Asher. It was also decided that the next planting would occur in the spring of 2017. Mr. Asher stated that once approved by the board, the resident would receive a letter with the planting date/information by the Planning/Zoning department. **Mr. DeRoss moved to approve the planting of the tree, Mrs. Pittenger seconded, and unanimously approved. Motion carried.**
- 239 S. Sixth St. – Removal by City
 - Mr. DeRoss questioned that a blue ribbon was present on the tree and wanted to make sure that this was not something that the city did to identify the tree in question. Mr. Asher stated that it was not something

October 12, 2016

that the city did and was not sure why there was a blue ribbon on the tree. The original application, by the resident Diana Crumrine, states that the request for removal is due to the tree being an Ash ~~Borer~~. Mr. DeRoss confirmed the type of tree, also noting that the top of the tree is dead, but the sides of the tree are living and doing well. Mrs. Pittenger suggested that the tree could be trimmed up before a full removal is conducted. It was then agreed by Mr. Asher and the board members that because it is an Ash tree, it should just be taken down and not to bother with trimming. Mrs. Pittenger brought up the location of the Ash tree being in a compromising place; really close to the corner. She suggested that it would not be a good idea to replant a tree in the exact same spot and to wait the 2 years until the Ash came down. She did note that there was an open spot elsewhere on the property that looked, as though, another tree had been taken down in the past. Mr. Asher agreed and confirmed that there had been another tree taken down in the open space in the years past. **Mr. DeRoss moved to approve the planting of the tree. Mr. Blake seconded, and unanimously approved. Motion carried.**

- 540 Horton Ave. – Planting by City
 - The original application, by the resident Carol Orange, states that the city removed Walnut trees 2 years ago. Mr. DeRoss asked for confirmation of the type of tree that was removed and Mr. Asher confirmed. Mr. DeRoss stated that this request would be added to the Spring 2017 Planting List and moved to approve the planting of the tree. **Mr. Blake seconded, and unanimously approved. Motion carried.**
- 317 S. Second St – Removal by City
 - The original application, by the resident Reed Haas, requests the tree be removed due to uprooting of the sidewalk. Mr. DeRoss stated that the corner of the sidewalk has been raised at least 3 inches and poses a hazard. He also noted a hole in the side of the tree (possibly due to poor healing). Mr. DeRoss moved to approve the removal of the tree. **Mr. Blake seconded, and unanimously approved. Motion carried.**
- 317 N. Second St– Removal by City
 - The original application, by the resident Joseph Watson, requests the tree be removed due to death. The board agreed that the death of the tree occurred a long time ago and Mr. DeRoss requests that this location have priority, due to the limbs posing a hazard. **Mr. DeRoss moved to approve the removal of the tree, Mr. Blake seconded, and unanimously approved. Motion carried.**
- 335 N. Second St. – Removal by City
 - Mr. DeRoss stated that Mrs. Pittenger noted two dead Ash trees and request for removal. **Mr. Asher agreed to add location for removal.**

October 12, 2016

(Tree Planting/Removal Requests, cont.)

- Memorial tree for David Lightle – Mr. Asher has already ordered.
 - Mr. Asher states that the tree has been ordered and will be planted this fall.
- Mr. Blake asked if the tree located in front of the American Legion building, 377 N 3rd St., had been examined and questioned if it was on the private property. Jim Asher replied stating that he believed the American Legion was going to be claiming the tree. The board agreed that although it would be a great loss to remove the tree, the uprooted sidewalk is a hazard.

25A Reconstruction Tree Planting

Mr. Vic Robert, representing RB Jergens, spoke regarding the 25A Reconstruction Tree Planting project. The project has been completed up to the point of planting 60 trees. It is noted that the city has picked 5 different types of trees to be planted. The city engineer, John Donnelly, asked Mr. Roberts to address the board members regarding the types of trees chosen. The particular tree in question is the Renaissance Birch. Mr. Roberts included a few references to include:

- Haugen, D.; Katovich, S.; Spears, B.; Wawrzynski, R. (Retrieved 2016, October 11). *How to Grow and Maintain a Healthy Birch*. https://www.na.fs.fed.us/spfo/pubs/howtos/ht_birch/ht_birch.htm;
- Kalb, Tom (2014, Nov. 15). *Birch: A winter wonder*. <https://www.ag.ndsu.edu/yardandgardenreport/documents/2014-11-15/birch-a-winter-wonder.htm>;
- Jull, L. G. (Retrieved 2016, October 11). *Tree of Knowledge, Trees to Avoid Planting in the Midwest and Some Excellent Alternatives- Part 1*. <http://www.pestid.msu.edu/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/Trees-to-avoidf623.pdf>.

Within these readings, Mr. Robert noted the following: "Though homeowners often desire birch as an ornamental tree, they soon discover that birch can be very difficult to maintain as a healthy, long-lived specimen. In many landscapes, birch trees begin to decline within a few years, and many trees die well before reaching maturity." "In the forest, birch trees thrive on cool, moist soils. Their very shallow root system makes them sensitive to even short periods of drought or heating of the soil, thus they grow poorly on hot, dry soils." In highlighting this information, Mr. Roberts states that he worries about the Birch tree being able to withstand the salt used on the roads. "Birch trees are not the easiest of trees to grow. They demand cool, shaded soils to do well. The healthiest stands of birch in nature are found in cool, moist soils and in groups of hundreds of trees. Unfortunately, we often plant birches as a solitary clump in the sunny front yard. This can be a stressful place since birches are sensitive to heat. Borers can detect this stress and will kill these trees. Keep birches out of the harsh afternoon sun." Mr. Roberts notes that the current plan asks for these trees to be planted in direct sun all day long, next to the street. Mr. Roberts also stated, "According to Dr. Laura Jull, trees to avoid planting in the

October 12, 2016

Midwest. She specifically states that 'White barked birches, especially the Renaissance Reflection Birch tree' is not a good idea in an urban setting."

Steve Combs, of L.S. Combs Inc. (having been in the tree business since 1978) spoke agreeing with Mr. Roberts. The concerns that Mr. Combs has with the birch tree are as follows:

- Not long lived.
- Do not thrive when planted in the fall- possibly due to the shallow root system not adapting to cold weather.
- Close proximity to the road and the exposure to salt.
- The choice of the birch makes up 1/3 of the trees being planted.

Mr. Combs made the following suggestions:

- Eliminate all of the birch and replace with a different variety as provided in the choices relayed in the plans. An Adirondack Crab or Elms would also be good choices.
- Eliminate only some of the birch. This option is not highly recommended, due to the fragility of the birch variety.

Mr. DeRoss stated that when the board originally was given the task of choosing trees for the project, the board was looking to place large trees. Because there weren't any large trees on the selection list, the board looked at medium tree types. On behalf of the board, Mr. DeRoss stated that the board did not choose the birch tree as an option. Mr. Asher stated that when the project was first developed, under the previous City Engineer, the plan allowed for large trees in the space provided. To date, the current City Engineer states that there needs to be an allowance for a proposed, future sidewalk. This would only allow for small trees to be planted in this same area. Because of the concerns stated earlier, it was suggested that the board consider permanently removing the birch type from the choices. Mr. Blake requested clarification of the location on the site plan of where the trees were going to be placed. Mr. Asher and Mr. DeRoss stated that they were supposed to be placed close to the corners and a small tree would need to be chosen. Mr. Blake also asked if the original recommendations that the board made were present at the meeting. Mr. Asher stated not at this time, nor did Mr. Roberts, Mr. Combs, Mr. DeRoss, and Mrs. Pittenger had them as well. Looking at the current suggested list of small trees, while maintaining within the budget, providing variety, and availability, Mr. Combs suggested the following small trees to replace the birch (Mr. Asher read and described the choices):

- Endowment Maple: beautiful color, are tall.
- Corinthian Linden: a lot like the Maple.
- Ginkgo: durable, yellow color.

Mr. Blake moved to approve the removal of the 21 Renaissance Reflection Birch from the list of choice for the project and replace all 21 with the Princeton Sentury Ginkgo. Mrs. Pittenger seconded, and unanimously approved. Motion carried.

October 12, 2016

- Mr. Combs asked to confirm that the project will require the planting of the trees as if the sidewalk proposal will occur. **Mr. Asher and the board members all agreed.**
- Mr. Asher asked Mr. Combs and Mr. Roberts to review the Phase 2 tree selections and to assess if any changes should be made. Mr. Combs stated that the he thought availability would be a concern for the Turkish and the Crimson Spire Oak. He also suggested to call several nurseries, such as Browns, Studebakers, Listerman & Assoc., and Deters to check the availability of all of the trees.
- Mr. Blake stated on behalf of the board, that Mr. Asher would be allowed to make the final decision on the type of tree selected if availability concerns arose.

Old Business**Ash Tree Removal Update by Anthony Freels**

Mr. Freels states the trees currently on the list for removal have not yet been removed, due to another job (power line circuits). Mr. DeRoss asked how much longer before completion. Mr. Freels stated that as long as the weather is allowing them to be off road, they will be completing all of those jobs before completing curb lawn projects.

Miscellaneous**Tree Academy Report**

Mr. Blake states that he had a scheduling conflict with current classes. Mr. Blake spoke with Wendy, who stated that he could attend those classes again next fall. Mr. Blake states that he is still continuing with his current project and he and Mrs. Pittenger will be going forward with inspecting the neighborhood off of Tippecanoe. Mrs. Pittenger agreed.

Fall Tree Planting

Mr. Asher stated that due to budget constraints, there will only be about 10 trees being planted this fall. Prices and purchase orders have been obtained. Plans have been made to plant within the first two weeks of November 2016.

Items Not on the Agenda

The board questioned for clarification of when they should present at the Operating Budget meeting on October 24, 2016. Board Secretary, Dawn Gross stated that she would find out and have the new Board Secretary, Jennica Whitt notify the board members. The board members requested approximately 10-15 minutes to present information. The board also asked if the summary that had been sent to Mrs. Gross would be available to the Council at the meeting. Mrs. Gross stated that she would give it to the clerk. Mr. DeRoss stated that he would like it if they had it in advance for review.

TIPP CITY, MIAMI COUNTY

TREE BOARD

October 12, 2016

Adjournment

Chairman DeRoss asked for further discussion or comments. There being none, **Mr. DeRoss moved for adjournment, seconded by Ms. Pittenger and unanimously approved. Motion carried.** Meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

APPROVED: _____



Thomas DeRoss, Board Chairman

ATTEST: _____


Jennica Whitt, Board Secretary